

iscte

INSTITUTO
UNIVERSITÁRIO
DE LISBOA

Reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism in Portugal

Raquel Proença Furtado de Sequeira Martinho

Master in International Studies,

Supervisor:

PhD Eduard Gargallo, Integrated Researcher,
ISCTE – University Institute of Lisbon

2023, October



SOCIOLOGIA
E POLÍTICAS PÚBLICAS

Reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism in Portugal

Raquel Proença Furtado de Sequeira Martinho

Master in International Studies,

Supervisor:

PhD Eduard Gargallo, Integrated Researcher,

ISCTE – University Institute of Lisbon

2023, October

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my gratitude to Doctor Eduard Gargallo for the support and encouragement during the realization of this dissertation.

I dedicate this research to everyone who has motivated me to complete this dissertation.

Resumo

Esta dissertação centra-se na questão das reparações no contexto do tráfico transatlântico de pessoas escravizadas e do colonialismo em Portugal. Explora as discussões sobre o tema e analisa possíveis reparações que podem acontecer em Portugal. Desta forma, o estudo analisa debates sobre o tópico em programas televisivos e podcasts; artigos científicos sobre o abuso sexual de mulheres Africanas durante o período colonial; uma proposta de reparação elaborada pelo partido político português LIVRE; o Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Escravos e o Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas como tipos que reparação que visam responsabilizar e demonstrar o envolvimento de Portugal no tráfico transatlântico de pessoas escravizadas e do colonialismo. Os resultados da pesquisa destacam que as narrativas nacionalistas continuam a dificultar o processo de reparações; há uma falta de pressão externa de outros países para que Portugal deva fazer reparações; que a questão das reparações é discutida em artigos científicos, programas de televisão e podcasts; um partido político Português já propôs o retorno de arte africana aos seus países de origem; o Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Escravos apresenta-se como um tipo de reparação implementada em Portugal; o Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas pode ser uma medida de reparação a ser implementada no futuro. A pesquisa permitiu também concluir que uma reformulação da historiografia portuguesa, a construção de museus e monumentos em homenagem a pessoas escravizadas e colonizadas emerge como uma forma possível de reparação que Portugal pode considerar implementar no futuro, aplicando ao mesmo tempo uma perspectiva sensível ao género.

Palavras-chave: reparações históricas, memória colonial, pós-colonialismo, Direitos Humanos

Abstract

This dissertation focuses on the issue of reparations in the context of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism in Portugal. It explores discussions on the topic and analyses possible reparations that can take place in Portugal. Therefore, the study examines debates on the subject in television programs and podcasts; scientific articles on the sexual abuse of African women during the colonial period; a reparation proposal developed by the Portuguese political party LIVRE; the Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Escravos and the Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas as types of reparations that aim to hold Portugal accountable and demonstrate its involvement in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism. The research results show that nationalist narratives continue to hinder the reparations process; there is a lack of external pressure from other countries for Portugal to make reparations; the issue of reparations is discussed in scientific articles, television programs, and podcasts; a Portuguese political party has already proposed the return of African art to its countries of origin; the Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Escravos is considered as a type of reparation implemented in Portugal; the Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas may be a reparation measure to be implemented in the future. The research also allowed concluding that a restructuring of Portuguese historiography, the construction of museums and monuments in tribute to enslaved and colonized people, emerges as a possible form of reparation that Portugal may consider implementing in the future, while also applying a gender sensitive perspective.

Keywords: historical reparations, colonial memory, Postcolonialism, Human Rights

Index

Aknowledgments	iii
Resumo	v
Abstract.....	vii
Introduction.....	1
Research Plan and Methodologies	3
Research Problem	3
Object of Study and Research Question.....	5
Aim of the Research.....	5
Research Objectives	5
Theoretical Framework	6
Tools.....	6
Selecting Portugal as a Case Study	7
Time Frame	7
Methodologies.....	8
Literature Review.....	9
Defining reparations.....	9
Challenges of reparations	10
Reparations for sexual violence	12
Reparations for sexual violence and its challenges	15
Collection of data and survivors' participation in decision-making process.....	17
Reparations for colonialism and sexual violence occurring during Portuguese colonialism.....	18
Findings and Discussion	21
Findings.....	21
Discussion of findings.....	30
Conclusions.....	35
Sources.....	39
Bibliographical References	43

Introduction

The question of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism has arisen from international debates. The past three decades have been marked by countries' attempts to memorialize these two periods in history.

The term "reparation" has been used to describe possible amendments for past wrongs. During the twentieth century, the term appeared in international law and in the Human Rights field to describe measures that aim to redress physical, material, or moral damage committed against an individual, group or nation. Thus, it has often been associated with measures that aim to amend wartime damages (Araújo, 2019, pp. 1-2).

The request for reparations has a long history. Records show that it started at the end of the eighteenth century, nevertheless, projects that aimed to give compensation to enslaved people failed. The context of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism changed after the reparations for the Jewish victims of the Holocaust after the Second World War, since the topic started to gain more public attention (Araújo, 2019, pp. 2-3).

Reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism do not always aim to restore the previous conditions of the people that have been affected by them, but rather to compensate for the current situation people could be in and that relate to the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism. Thus, reparations aim to repair the harm caused by violence. This can be done in various ways, namely, through financial compensation, rehabilitation, formal apologies, building of monuments, repatriation of artifacts, etc. Hence, reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism are relevant since they contribute to a fairer society.

The academic research of the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism has been focused on financial compensation and moral compensation. Investigation has been centred on reparations that have been implemented in former colonizing countries. The literature pertaining to the issue of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism in Portugal has been focused on highlighting the responsibility Portugal had in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism and measures of memorialization of survivors.

In Portugal, the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism has been discussed in newspapers, television debates and podcasts. Furthermore, the topic has been addressed by Portuguese political parties, mainly through proposal for reparations. Finally, Portugal has also installed a museum centred on the role of Portugal in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people, and approved a project that memorializes the victims of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

The aim of this dissertation is to discuss the various types of reparations Portugal could make for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism, departing from the question “How is the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism being addressed in Portugal?”.

Thus, the dissertation is divided in four sections. First, it will determine the research plan and methodologies, providing an explanation about the research problem, research objectives, framework of analysis and the selection of Portugal as a case-study. Secondly, it will present a literature review about the topic of reparations for the transatlantic of enslaved people and colonialism, its definition, types, and challenges; shedding light on the often-overlooked issue of sexual violence against African women during colonialism. Thirdly, it will explore the sources selected for the discussion and possible recommendations for the future. Finally, it will summarize the conclusions about the research.

CHAPTER 1

Research Plan and Methodologies

Considering the contextualization previously presented, this dissertation will explore Portugal's relationship with reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism.

The project aims to explore how nationalism can hinder countries' attempts to make reparations; how a national narrative can disqualify colonial rape as a crime against Humanity, giving as an example the Portuguese case; evaluate Portugal's attempts at making reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people; and generate recommendations for future reparations.

Thus, with the need of a starting point I have formulated a research question, which will be the focus of the thesis. This dissertation will answer the question "How is the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism being addressed in Portugal?".

This chapter provides the framework of analysis to answer the research question. First, it defines the research problem. Secondly, it describes the research objectives. Next, it explains the aim of the research. Fourthly, it demonstrates the theoretical framework. Finally, it describes the analytical framework of the thesis, explaining the collection of data.

Research Problem

When making reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism two situations can occur: 1) a request for reparations for the general effects of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism on a country or countries; 2) a request for collective reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism; or 3) a request for individual reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism.

In the case of general reparations, formal apologies and acknowledgements of injustices, educational reforms, return of artifacts to their place of origin, memorialization of victims/survivors of enslavement and colonialism, naming of streets or buildings after someone, or the removal of monuments and renaming of streets that honour colonizers and defenders of colonization are considered to be more appropriate.

In the case of collective reparations it targets 1) a group of people who suffered harm as a result of violations of Human Rights; 2) a community where a group of people described in (1) resides (for instance, a massacre taking place in a specific location); 3) a group of people described in (1) who are connected by cultural and ancestral bonds (e.g., an indigenous community); or 4) the particular benefit given to the group who suffered harm (e.g., the construction or re-construction of infrastructure or income generating projects) (United Nations, 2014, p. 7).

In the case of individual reparations, it targets an individual whose Human Rights have been violated. Collective and individual reparations have the particularity of the possibility of the cases to be taken to trial, as well as the possibility of rehabilitation or financial reparation.

This project will focus on both cases, it will seek to explore reparations for the transatlantic trade and Portuguese colonialism in general, and explore reparations for specific cases of violation of Human Rights, e.g., sexual abuse of people that were colonized, the Massacre of Batepa, etc. It also considers that reparations are more effective when different forms of reparations occur at the same time.

Moreover, when addressing reparations for Human Rights violations that occurred under colonial rule there is a significant absence or rather neglect of the sexual abuse of people that were colonized. This issue must be addressed since their testimonies on the colonial rule and its effects on them are relevant for the protection of Human Rights, constitutional laws and policies that should be implemented after the transition from the colonial regime to a post-colonial regime that prevent the reoccurrence of sexual abuse of vulnerable groups, promote their rehabilitation and reduce the stigma against victims of sexual violence.

Portugal's has justified the refusal for reparations with Luso tropicalism, i.e., the idea that Portuguese colonialism was 'kinder' than other types of colonialism. This is usually based on the myth that miscegenation is the product of a less racist colonizer, a theory originally formulated by Gilberto Freyre. I argue that this is still an obstacle for a serious and multidimensional dialogue about the Portuguese colonial past; it lacks objectivity, since one cannot evaluate the degrees of racism of different types of colonialism, additionally, it minimizes rape to a non-racist action – sometimes verging on a romantic or compassionate action. This project assumes sexual abuse as a crime committed against humanity and one that should be included in the discussions about reparations, therefore, I argue that the mass

rape of African, American and Asian bodies was not less racist, it was a weapon used against women and men of colonized countries.

Object of Study and Research Question

Therefore, the focus of the research will be on reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism, by exploring how the topic is being addressed in Portugal, particularly by analysing public interventions, political parties' proposal, policies referring to reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism, and possible reparations that have already been applied in Portugal, departing from the question: How is the topic of reparations for transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism being addressed in Portugal?

Aim of the Research

The aim of the research is to explain the ways in which the topic of reparations for Portuguese colonialism is being addressed in Portugal, as well as to generate recommendations concerning the issue. Therefore, I will briefly review the discussion about the types of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism in various scientific articles and media outlets. Secondly, I will describe some of the reparation policies that may have been implemented in Portugal, while addressing its possible flaws. Finally, the research aims to explore the future of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism and its challenges.

Research Objectives

To answer the question “How is the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism being addressed in Portugal?” I have selected the following research objectives:

- Explain the types of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism that have been discussed in Portugal.
- Identify reparation policies that aim to amend the effects of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism that may have been implemented in Portugal.

- Explore possible reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism that can be implemented in the future.

Theoretical Framework

Postcolonialism, feminism and restorative justice theories are the theoretical support of this thesis. First, postcolonial theory is a critical approach that challenges implicit superiority European forms of reason, morals and law. It tries to reflect on the dynamics of our contemporary world considering the influence colonialism still has in the present (Young, 2020, p. 2).

Secondly, restorative justice theory acknowledges the crime harms victims and aims to repair the harm to the victim in a process where the perpetrator and victim participate. Its focus is on facilitation of truth-telling, reconciliation, restoration and healing (Johnstone et al., 2007, p. 5). This theory is relevant for the present project, since it evaluates the discussion about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism, providing a blueprint for the measures needed to be applied when making reparations in relation to Portugal.

Finally, feminist theory defends social, economic, political and personal equality for all genders, considering women's experiences. While demonstrating gender inequality, it considers women's class, race, religion, sexual preference, etc., to evaluate the disparity that also exists between women (Hooks, 2000, pp. 18-19). This theory is relevant for this study since it will also focus on women's experience of colonialism.

Tools

The data will be collected through primary sources and secondary sources. As primary sources, I will use political parties' proposals for reparations, monuments and museums. As secondary sources, I will use scientific articles, television programs episodes and podcast episodes.

I must also bring attention to the possible bias present in the documents I have selected, since most were produced by left-wing politics supporters. The exclusion of right-wing programmes is due to the lack of reflection about memory issues concerning reparations in their programmes.

Selecting Portugal as a Case Study

Portugal was the first country to establish the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and to colonize various countries. Nevertheless, it has found ways to justify its imperial past and rarely acknowledges its impact on former colonies, as well as its violations of Human Rights. Despite the discussion about reparations for colonialism and slavery still being small in Portugal, the country is a relevant case-study for its significant role in colonialism and transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

Portugal has avoided the topic and other times denied reparations for two main reasons. First, Portugal has pointed miscegenation as a reason to not offer reparations, defending that what differentiates Portuguese colonialism from other countries that were part of the colonization process is how Portugal was less racists than other colonizers by occulting the fact that miscegenation was also a product of mass rape of women. Therefore, Portugal is a relevant case-study since by analysing it we can identify narratives countries use to avoid or deny reparations.

Secondly, one important factor for denial of reparations is that former colonies have not pressured Portugal for reparations, additionally, the non-existence of organized communities fighting for reparations. Thus, Portugal can show how external pressure for reparations is important for reparations to occur.

Third, Portugal only recently approved the instalment of a monument in honour of enslaved people in the plantations of Brazil. Hence, by selecting Portugal as a case I can investigate the issues concerning reparations that have been implemented and what can be done in the future.

Furthermore, selecting Portugal as a case allows me to study the issue of sexual abuse during colonialism and what narratives are still dominant in Portugal and that permit the neglect of sexual abuse victims.

Time Frame

As for the time frame, the research will be focused on sources starting from 2016 until the present, which corresponds to the period where museums dedicated to the transatlantic trade of enslaved people were installed in Portugal, discussions of the topic intensified, proposals

for reparations have been made, TV programs and podcasts have highlighted the issue and the instalment of a monument in honour of enslaved people.

The sources selected from 2016 are only two: the book “Geometrias da Memória: Configurações Pós-Coloniais” (2016) and the instalment of Núcleo Museológico Rota da Escravatura in Lagos.

I emphasize that the public discussions about the topic intensified in 2017. The proposal for the Museu da Descoberta in Lisbon; Marcelo Rebelo de Sousa’s, President of Portugal, speech in Senegal and the project Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas facilitated debates and the publishment of articles about the legacy of Portuguese colonialism and its role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

Since then, the debate has occurred in various media platforms.

Methodologies

Due to the sensitivity of the topic, accounts from survivors can be difficult to obtain, hence the collection of data will be done through documental and secondary data. Thus, through these different methods I intend to access Portugal’s responses to the topic of reparations, as well as the data that has been collected on what survivors aim for reparations.

Thus, the documental and secondary data selected are monuments honouring enslaved people, parties' proposals, TV programs, e.g., Debate Prós e Contrás (2018, “Descobertas ou Descobrimientos”, season 16, episode 24), and podcasts, e.g., Podcast Fumaça (2019, “Debate: ‘Abolida a escravatura, quem foi compensado? Os donos dos escravos’, Inocência Mata”).

CHAPTER 2

Literature Review

The aim of this chapter is to contextualize the research, explaining the theories and arguments generated by scholars about reparations for colonialism and the transatlantic trade of enslaved people, towards formulating the state of the art for the project's object of study: how the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism being addressed in Portugal.

Thus, this chapter is divided into five sections. The first section introduces the definition of reparations, it also contemplates the definition of five types of reparations, as well as the differences between collective and individual reparations. Secondly, it explains the challenges of reparations. The third part explores reparations focused on sexual violence situations during conflicts. Next, it will explore the importance of the collection of data and survivors' participation in the decision-making process.

The last part will correlate all the previous sections and its importance for the Portuguese case, since Portugal was part of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people from 1444 till 1836, was a colonizer from 1415 till 1999, and the narrative that prevails and that defends that sexual violence against women's bodies was a consensual act, which is still a part of the national narrative about Portuguese colonialism.

Defining reparations

Over the years, scholars have been defining the term 'reparations' as policies that aim at making amendments for Human Rights violations, i.e., forms of compensation for physical, material or moral damage suffered by an individual, group of individuals or nations. Usually, types of reparations are divided in two categories: 1) moral or symbolic, often associated with formal apologies, guarantees against repetition, measures of rehabilitation, etc; and 2) financial and material compensation, e.g., victims/survivors receive money or other possessions, for instance, land (Alfred, 2006, pp. 7-9; Araujo, 2019, p. 2).

Alfred defines two types of reparations: 1) backward-looking – this relates to reparations that intend to correct the past, e.g., truth commissions, apologies, individual payments, etc.; and 2) forward-looking – in other words, policies that recognize the past harm, without trying

to find the exact value of those harms, and try to improve the future, e.g., community-building programs (Alfred, 2006, pp. 7-8). Other scholars argue that effective programs of reparations must include the following components:

- Satisfaction reparations – This type of reparation admits that it is necessary to establish the truth about the past. Satisfaction reparations include formal apologies, acknowledgments, commemorations and/or the building of monuments (Cunneen, 2005, p. 66; United Nations, 2014, pp. 17-18).
- Guarantees against repetition – Mostly by developing educational materials. In this case, measures should be sensitive to the circumstances of each country and the conflict and post-conflict situation (ibid, p. 66; ibid, p. 20).
- Measures of restitution – Attempts to establish the situation that was prior to the violation of Human Rights (ibid, pp. 66-67; ibid, pp. 15-16).
- Measures of rehabilitation – Mental and physical assistance to victims/survivors that are needed to aid them to move on and to carry out their lives in a dignified way (ibid, p. 67; ibid, p. 18).
- Monetary compensation (Cunneen, 2005, p. 67).

It is suggested that reparations are more effective when different forms of reparation are applied at the same time to the same individual or group of individuals. Reparations can be individual or collective. They serve different purposes and can complement each other; however, they are not substitutes for one another (United Nations, 2014, pp. 5-7).

The term ‘collective reparations’ has been used in cases of 1) a group of people who suffered harm as a result of violations of Human Rights; 2) a community where a group of people described in 1) resides (such as a massacre taking place in a specific location); 3) a group of people described in 1) who are connected by cultural and ancestral bonds (such as an indigenous community); or 4) the particular benefit given to the group who suffered harm (like the construction or re-construction of infrastructure or income generating projects) (United Nations, 2014, p. 7).

Challenges of reparations

While literature suggests that former colonizers should give reparations to colonized countries it contradicts itself on the types of reparations groups should get and who should get reparations. Recent literature shows that historical memory education and apologies are not

sufficient in making reparations; nevertheless, stances on apologies differ: 1) while some authors claim that they are a starting point on the discussion and may lead to other types of reparations; 2) others claim that public speeches and public apologies can be forms of self-justification for the refusal to accountability and other types of reparation (Alfred, 2006, pp. 11-14; Araujo, 2019, p. 6; Bentley, 2018, p. 399; Cunneen, 2005, pp. 65-79).

The literature reviewed about the challenges of reparations frequently focuses on the challenges of financial reparations and formal apologies, and rarely covers the challenges of other types of reparations.

Overall, scholars are more centred in financial reparations than on other types of reparations, which can be done through financial aid or through debt relief, the latter particularly refers to African countries. Moreover, some authors support financial compensation and oppose donating money to organizations, since it is the former colonizer who decides how money should be used for the victims/survivors without previously consulting the victims/survivors, assuming a paternalistic position. Moreover, it can frame the former colonizer as a philanthropic actor (Bentley, 2018, pp. 409-410).

Literature centred on state apologies indicates that state apologies can be problematic, because they can be done badly, additionally, it is often the colonizer that speaks to the colonized, thus the former colonizer can create whatever representation of itself and the otherness that it wants, thus the former colonizer can present itself in a good light (Bentley, 2018, pp. 399-404).

Recent postcolonial literature focused on state apologies reveal that state apologies may not happen over a resentment about the colonial past e.g., some argue that the state apologies can come from narcissism, be a way to cleanse colonial shame and guilt, be a tool of nation-making, etc. Furthermore, some authors have identified some of the problems of state apologies: 1) the 'colonial' state continues the daily process of nation-engineering and colonial consolidation; and 2) the apology gives continuity to colonial enterprise, by considering that victims/survivors are part of state's citizens, i.e., including them in the national identity (Bentley, 2018, p. 402).

In result, some scholars, such as Celermajer and Moses, question the effectiveness of state apology as a form of reparations and compare it to colonial practices, since the one that controls

the narrative is the former colonizer, therefore generating or reinforcing stereotypes and power relations (ibid, p. 411).

Shiver's model of forgiveness suggests that while for some survivors an apology is needed in order to heal, for others it is not necessary. The model considers that forgiveness aims to restore a relationship, which can be achieved through confession, ownership and repentance from the wrongdoer. For instance, most of the East Germans who participated in Andrews's study expressed that remorse from the wrongdoer is necessary for forgiveness. Nevertheless, one of the participants did not seek remorse from the wrongdoer to heal (Andrews, 2019, pp. 437-439).

It was reported in literature that one element that hinders historical reparations to happen is the fact that frequently civil society and/or minorities show distrust in the government negotiations for reparations, due to the lack of visibility and representativeness of survivors' narratives in those negotiations. Additionally, some of the groups that were victims/survivors of violent crimes are a minority within those countries which contributes to the exclusion of affected groups from the decision-making process (Bentley, 2018, p. 400; Melber, 2020, pp. 503-504).

Most scholars agree that nationalism is one of the most important reasons for the refusal of discussion about one's nation's crimes and reparations, thus understanding how nations reflect about their past is important to understand why they have not made reparations yet.

Several studies suggest that in post-conflict situations policies should be established to mitigate conflict in the future, considering existing inequalities in a society – positive peace. To do this, everyone's experiences of war must be considered. In recent years, there has been an increase of women's accounts and experiences of conflict, which both highlights violence inflicted on them, as well as their involvement in violence and/or motivating the men in their communities to be violent; however, violence against women remains underreported (Pankhurst, 2003, pp. 156-158).

Reparations for sexual violence

The UN Secretary-General's Guidance Note on reparations for sexual violence related to conflicts seeks to offer guiding principles for practical involvement and advice on examining various reparation options. It emphasizes the importance of assessing the repercussions,

sensitivities, and stigmas attached to conflict-related sexual violence. Additionally, it underscores the necessity of addressing the unique needs of survivors of sexual and gender-based violence (United Nations, 2014, p. 2).

Following the UN Analytical and Conceptual Framing of Conflict-Related Sexual Violence definition of conflict-related sexual violence it is described as situations of sexual violence against women, men, girls or boys that occur during conflict or in post-conflict contexts that may directly or indirectly be related with a conflict:

any sexual act, attempt to obtain a sexual act, unwanted sexual comments or advances, or acts to traffic, or otherwise directed against a person's sexuality using coercion, by any person regardless of their relationship to the victim, in any setting. (United Nations, 2010, p. 1).

Therefore, rape, sexual enslavement, forced prostitution, forced pregnancy, forced sterilization, forced abortion, sexual exploitation, trafficking, forced circumcision, castration, forced nudity, inappropriate medical examinations and strip searches are all forms of sexual violence, and depending on the context they can be considered:

- War crimes, if they are committed and associated with an armed conflict;
- Crimes against humanity, when committed as part of a widespread or systematic attack against a civilian population, e.g., rape, sexual enslavement, forced prostitution, forced pregnancy, forced sterilization, etc. Sexual violence can be considered a crime against humanity when it is part of a government policy, tolerated or condoned by a government, authority or organized armed group;
- Genocide, in situations where there is an intention to destroy national, ethnical, racial or religious groups, e.g., killing members of groups, causing serious physical or mental harm to members of groups, implementing policies to prevent births within groups, transferring children of a group to another group.
- Torture, when there is an intention to inflict severe physical or mental pain or suffering upon a person.
- Or other forms of violations of Human Rights (ibid, pp. 1-2; United Nations, 2014, pp. 2-3).

Survivors of conflict-related sexual violence are considered to be persons who have suffered violence; family members, e.g., children or partners; and children born as a result of

pregnancy from rape; persons who depend on the survivor of sexual violence; persons who have been harmed whilst assisting survivors of sexual violence (United Nations, 2014, p. 3).

An 'armed conflict' is an armed confrontation between parties over a period and at a level that goes beyond the ordinary law and order operations. Parties are armed forces under a command structure who can sustain military operations, this includes State and non-State actors. In order to identify a conflict-related sexual violence situation it is necessary to evaluate 1) the temporality of the crime, i.e., when violence occurs during a time of instability that may escalate to armed conflict; during armed conflict; during a period of occupation or against persons deprived of their liberty; and when it occurs in the aftermath of conflict, but prior to the restoration of State capacity/authority; 2) geography, this means, when violence happens in conflict-affected areas; and 3) causality, when the conflict played an important role in the perpetrator's decision to commit sexual violence, how it was committed and for what purpose (United Nations, 2010, pp. 2-3).

Recent studies demonstrate how women tend to suffer more than men in post-conflict contexts: they usually must take care of survivors and they also experience high rates of injury, death and sexual abuse; some of the effects of sexual abuse are: stigmatization, physical and mental injury, illness, death, etc. Moreover, the experiences of girls during war are less documented than those of boys, and women frequently feel like they have no control over their narrative, often being categorized by others as innocent victims or courageous participants in war (Pankhurst, 2003, p. 159).

Nevertheless, while women and girls are often victims of conflict-related sexual violence, men and boys are also victims of the same crime. Furthermore, inequality and violence patterns against minorities preceding the conflict are often aggravated during the conflict, hence the risk of vulnerability for minorities increases (United Nations, 2014, p. 3).

Hence, all survivors of conflict-related sexual violence should be treated equally, to prevent further harm, trauma and stigmatization, regardless of their sex, gender identity, ethnicity, race, age, political affiliation, class, marital status, sexual orientation, nationality, religion, disability, or any other status (ibid, p. 4).

Frequently, the physical and psychological harm of sexual violence and stigmatization hinders survivors from seeking or obtaining reparations. For instance, in contexts where women suffer from structural inequality and have no access to education and reproductive

resources, loss of family support can lead to destitution; furthermore, in cases of sexual violence against men and boys, homophobia and emasculation of survivors may result in stigma making it more difficult for men and boys to talk about their abuse (ibid, p. 5).

Nevertheless, women are rarely part of peace agreements, and their concerns are often neglected. For instance, despite studies showing that sexual violence increases in post-conflict situations policies to protect women from sexual violence are still very rare (Pankhurst, 2003, p. 160). After conflict, women are expected to return to the activities and traditional roles they had before the conflict, hindering their representation in decision-making processes and possible constitutional amendments that could protect them, thus there is often a neglect of women's needs and rights after conflict.

In result, the differences between men and women are reinforced, particularly in contexts where discrimination of certain ethnic groups exists; the role which was played by women during conflict contributes to the reassertion of the differences between men and women i.e., whether they are seen as 'victors' or 'perpetrators'/collaborators' or if they have given birth to the children of 'the enemy' as a result of rape can determine which women will receive government aid (ibid, p. 161). Hence, scholars suggest that the path to protect victims/survivors of sexual violence during conflict would be to: 1) make women's voices be heard – gender mainstreaming; 2) implement welfare policies that include women; include women; 3) promote peace education (ibid, p. 171).

Reparations for sexual violence and its challenges

The reparations previously mentioned in the section about the various types of reparations when applied to cases of sexual violence may face some challenges.

Satisfaction reparations

These measures have been rarely used in cases of conflict-related sexual violence, and when they were used, they reinforced existing stereotypes. Therefore, if they are to be used it is important to maintain confidentiality of survivors' identities (United Nations, 2014, pp. 17-18).

Guarantees against repetition

Truth commissions are important since they can identify the root causes of conflict, as well as conflict-related sexual violence and make recommendations to mitigate further abuse, for

instance, the implementation of a legal and institutional framework to protect women, men, girls and boy against sexual violence. Moreover, legislation should provide women and girls, who become pregnant as a result of sexual abuse, the opportunity of safe and legal abortion (United Nations, 2014, pp. 19-20).

Training and education are essential to prevent conflict-related sexual violence, it should be transmitted to the police and military personnel, and to any person who is in a position to deal with the harm experienced by survivors of conflict-related sexual violence, e.g., criminal justice officials, physicians, psychologists, social workers and members of human rights institutions (ibid, p. 20).

Measures of restitution

In conflict situations, due to stigma, many survivors lose their property and/or security of tenure and/or housing, physical health, employment, and cessation of education. It is necessary to establish policies that secure their property or tenure of property; prepare procedures to claim restitution; and make education and other programs accessible (ibid, pp. 15-16).

Measures of rehabilitation

Measures of rehabilitation intend to implement services that are needed to aid survivors to move on and to carry out their life in a dignified way. Rehabilitation does not only include health services and it should not only be directed to the person who experienced sexual violence, if possible, others, such as family members should also receive rehabilitation to increment the survivors' recovery (ibid, p. 18).

More importantly, access to mental health services should be given to survivors of conflict-related sexual violence and rehabilitation measures should acknowledge that men and boys that have suffered conflict-related sexual violence require different services than those of women and girls (ibid, p. 19).

Nevertheless, rehabilitation should not only have a gender sensitive approach, but also a culturally sensitive approach, since the way one understands trauma and treats it is influenced by culture also. The location of services should also be within the physical proximity of survivors (ibid, p. 19).

Monetary compensation

This type of compensation applies when a person has suffered moral and material damage as a consequence of conflict-related sexual violence. After conflict it may be difficult for women to access and keep money, moreover, the money is often used for other members of the family or for reasons not necessarily related to the harm inflicted on the survivors, e.g., payment of debts (ibid, pp. 16-17).

Financial compensation could provide them with financial independence and could aid them to distance themselves to somewhere else avoiding stigmatization, ostracism or dependence on others. Thus, compensation could occur in the form of benefits/pensions to be paid directly to the survivor of conflict-related sexual violence, whilst maintaining confidentiality; in the cases of child survivors, measures should be applied in order to ensure that funds are held in trust for the child until s/he reaches the age of majority, and/or are used for the child and can be accounted for by a legal guardian (ibid, p. 17).

Thus, a gender sensitive approach is also necessary to apply in this type of reparation, considering that in some contexts women stay at home looking after their family, in other situations they may be working on family land, where they do not receive any income (ibid, p. 17).

Collection of data and survivors' participation in decision-making process

Conflict-related sexual violence is often the result of a preceding structural subordination and discrimination that allowed sexual violence to happen for both men and women. For women, it often is the result of the belief of women's subordination and male sexual entitlement. For men, it is often the result of stereotypes about masculinity and constructions of gender and sexual identity around power and domination. Reparations should have the power to transform structural inequalities that allowed conflict-related sexual violence (ibid, pp. 8-9).

Therefore, when making collective reparations consultation with survivors of sexual violence is needed. During the consultation it should be considered if the survivors wills to have the presence of someone who would help them speak out about the experience, women's groups, defenders of the rights of minority and marginalized groups, and other civil society organizations working with conflict-related sexual violence and reparations (ibid, p. 8).

Reparations could also take the form of development projects, for example, when addressing the consequences of gender-based violence, reparations programs could empower women and allow them to participate in development decision-making (ibid, pp. 9-10).

Participation of child survivors should be done in a way that prevents further harm or trauma. They should be allowed to express their views and measures should be applied to ensure that their rights are protected and that they do not face discrimination. Hence, access to psychological support and treatment and to health services is necessary to promote the participation of survivors in the process and to ensure that it is beneficiary for them (ibid, p. 12).

It is important to include and consult survivors in the decision-making process, without marginalizing any group of survivors. For instance, it is necessary to consider limitations regarding mobility, including costs associated with it, therefore, decentralizing consultation could facilitate participation, since a more survivors are being reached and assure representativeness (ibid, pp. 10-12).

Literature also suggests that the reasons behind war rape are not fully explored by scholars. While most agree that rape as war crime is intended to undermine the sexuality of victims/survivors, as well as masculinity, some scholars link war rape to attempted genocide; however, Turshen suggests that that is not always the case arguing that there has been a neglect of men's motivation to gain access to property through women e.g., in some contexts, men were able to gain rights to women's land and access to their labor through forced 'marriage' (Pankhurst, 2003, p. 170). Thus, explaining the motivations for rape can help us understand how sexual violence during conflict can be used as a weapon and how we should not undermine it, additionally, it can help us predict future laws and measures that can and should be implemented in societies.

Reparations for colonialism and sexual violence occurring during Portuguese colonialism

The literature reviewed about reparations and national identities identifies Spain and Portugal as the only two countries that have not officially made reparations for their colonial past. The literature pertaining to this issue suggests that the term 'national amnesia' can be linked with the way Portugal avoids dealing with its past. The term 'culture of silence' has also been used

by some scholars regarding the atrocities inflicted on the natives of former colonies (Loff, 2014, p.3). Others define Portugal's relationship with its memory as a state of 'unmemory' i.e., the act of voluntarily forgetting (da Silva, 2019, p. 41).

Some scholars argue that the Portuguese government has overlooked and denied war crimes committed during the colonial period and has never made efforts to investigate and publicize African victims/survivors accounts of colonial repression; moreover, schoolbooks and educational curriculum gives continuity to the invisibility of Portuguese war crimes during the period of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonization (Loff, 2014, pp. 3-9).

Memorialization as a form of reparation has been gaining some attention in Portugal. Nevertheless, some scholars argue that monuments about colonial conflicts still honor national armies of former colonizers instead of critiquing colonialism (Caiado, 2020, p. 4-6).

In Portugal, sexual violence perpetrated against women has been represented as the existence of a multicultural society and miscegenation, neglecting the fact that women were sexually abused. Recent developments in the treatment of sexual violence in Portuguese colonialism emphasizes the presence of Luso tropicalist undertones in government speeches, which categorizes Portuguese colonialism as 'kinder' than other types of colonialisms and non-racist.

By this logic miscegenation derived from consensual sexual contact between Portuguese men and African women and assumes that the Portuguese were less racist than other European colonizer countries, even though this miscegenation was a product of mass rape, in order to subjugate African women and African men. In other words, the concepts 'miscegenation' or 'mestiçagem' have often been used to cover relations of power and domination and are usually present in national, imperial and colonial narratives, and still prevalent in today's narratives (Almeida, 2002, p. 181-195; Garraio, 2019, pp. 1560-1572).

So far, the literature reviewed presents some limitations. Literature on sexual violence against women under Portuguese colonial rule is still scarce. Nevertheless, the research has found one important contribution to the topic by Garraio with the exploration of the exposition "Retornar: Traços de Memória", which compiled pictures of the liberation wars, four of those featured African women unwilling being touched by Portuguese men. The scholar finds that the collection of photos represented African women's sexuality as a memory of Portuguese

colonialism and racialized constructions of sexual identity, which supports the theory of luso tropicalism – this article will be analysed in the fourth chapter.

Nevertheless, literature on sexual violence against women under the Portuguese colonial rule is more focused on the representation of this type of violence in fictional literature. Moreover, literature is more focused on Angola and Mozambique; at this point of research, literature about women who suffered from sexual abuse during Portuguese colonialism in Cape Verde, Guinea-Bissau, São Tomé e Príncipe, India, Macau and East Timor has not been found. Additionally, literature lacks data on male victims of sexual violence.

Furthermore, literature about reparations for Portuguese colonialism does not mention many of the forms of compensation for the violation of Human Rights, its focus is on official apologies, school curriculum and memorialization.

Finally, despite the increasing attention given to the topic, studies have failed to give the point of view of the victims of colonialism and what they wish for as reparations.

CHAPTER 3

Findings and Discussion

As primary sources, I have selected LIVRE's proposal for the return of artifacts to African countries and monuments. As secondary sources, I have selected discussions about the topic in Portuguese podcasts, television shows episodes and scientific articles. I aim to compare the sources and find both similarities and differences between them in their narrative and types of reparations that are suggested.

The selection of the secondary sources was based on the scarcity of initiatives from Portugal and former Portuguese colonies to make reparations. Thus, the secondary sources are not interpreted as a representation of a country's society. They are only a demonstration of the arguments that are given a voice. In other words, the selection of podcasts and tv shows as secondary sources will explain how the media has been addressing the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism.

Thus, this chapter is divided into three parts. First, it will explain similar and opposite positions found in podcasts, television shows episodes and book chapters. Secondly, it will explore reparation proposals and monuments. Finally, it will present a reflection on the findings.

Findings

In 2009, an archaeological excavation carried out in Valle de Gafaria, Lagos, discovered skeleton remains of 158 African enslaved individuals (50 non-adults, 30 men, 58 women and 19 of unknown sex) in a dump that was used in during the XV-XVII centuries. This osteological collection is the older sample to be discovered and studied in the world (Ferreira et al., 2019, p. 671).

Archaeologists recovered sets of imported pottery and bone remains of domestic animals and humans. Dead enslaved people without baptism were considered "damaged pieces", thus their burial was made in a dump, close to the harbour, where the damaged goods were discarded. (Ferreira et al., 2019, p. 678). Following the discovery, the Portuguese Committee of the project UNESCO A Rota do Escravo proposed the creation of the Museu de Escravatura. Hence, the museum was supposed to be divided in three parts: a slave market, a memorial in

the place where the bodies were found and a centre dedicated to slavery, this project was approved by the autarchy in 2011. Nevertheless, a minigolf course was later built in the place where the bodies were recovered (Martins et al., 2015).

In 2016, the Núcleo Museológico Rota da Escravatura was installed in Lagos. This museum is a possible example of a reparation measure, or at least it could be a blueprint for one, since the existence of a museum or a shared place is dedicated to the history of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and its relation to Portugal is singular in the country.

The book “Geometrias da Memória: Configurações Pós-Coloniais” (2016) compiles various articles written by scholars and that reflect Portugal’s national identity and collective memory. The articles selected for the project analyse the comparison between colonialism and the sexualization of African women’s bodies during colonialism. This source reflects on the persistence of lusotropicalism in Portugal’s portrait of colonialism and slavery.

Portuguese historiography contributed to the silencing of the Other. In schoolbooks the African people only appear as subjects of Portuguese "heroic" actions, they are seen as inhumane, animalized, without autonomy, rationality, identity and history. Therefore, it is necessary to revision concepts, ideas and perspectives used by the Portuguese historiography (Ribeiro et al., 2016, pp. 126-127) It was the dehumanization of African people that permitted Europeans to enslave African people in the name of salvation and later be justified as the "natural state" of African people (ibid, p. 129).

Garraio focus on the sexualization of African women’s bodies during colonialism, something that is still present today. The scholar gives as a demonstrative case the exposition “Retornar: Traços de Memória” (1975), which presented photos of the African liberation wars. Only four pictures of the exposition features women:

- A soldier appears laughing, he holds a black baby on his lap and hugs a black woman, whilst groping her breasts.
- A soldier, with his legs slightly spread, appears behind a black woman, leading himself on her and groping her breasts.
- The soldier hugs the black woman and touches her sex lifting her skirt, whilst both smile at the camera.

- An African family, the same soldier seated, surrounded by black women and children, smiling, a black woman is seated on his lap while he gropes her breasts.

The album which contained these pictures was called "family album" (Ribeiro et al., 2016, pp. 279-280). The colonies were seen and treated as places where savages lived, places of sexual abundance, pleasure and fun. The pictures could be part of the family album as "funny moments" (ibid, p. 291).

The author argues that the pictures of the soldier have a performative character that reflects the idea of the sexuality of black women's bodies as a memory of colonialism, a long tradition of narratives, power relations and racialized constructions of sexual identity, which comes from the myth of Luso tropicalism, i.e., the presence of black women's bodies in the Portuguese colonial memory is based on a racialized sexual violence imaginary (ibid, pp. 281-282).

Therefore, in the contemporary Portuguese society it is necessary to remember the importance of the black woman body in the Portuguese colonial photography. The photos taken by colonial empires only highlight the silence of their voices, since they did not have ways to contest their sexualization and violation. Black nudity was only possible in newspapers, postcards, expositions, because colonized women were projected and produced as sexualized amoral bodies (ibid, pp. 288-289).

As an example of this, Rosita, a Bantu woman, was brought to the "Exposição colonial do Porto", in 1934. She was a symbol of what the Portuguese empire should be: a space of sexually available women for the Portuguese men. The iconography represented colonial spaces as feminine and savage, and the territorial conquest as an imposition process led by imperial masculinity. At the same time, its natives were despised and the submission to the white man eroticized (ibid, p. 290).

While these aspects are common in other empires, we must consider the presence of Luso tropicalism in the Portuguese context. Portuguese propaganda supports national identity on the ideas of Gilberto Freyre, claiming that Portuguese colonialism is "more human" and inclined to miscegenation, identifying Portugal as a multicultural, multiracial and pluricontinental nation (ibid, pp. 290-291).

This idea is used to justify the continuity of Portuguese colonialism. The quote "deus criou o branco e o negro, o português criou o mulato" demonstrates the Luso tropical imaginary that

hypes miscegenation, regardless of the fact that it was a product of sexual violence (ibid, p. 291).

Miscegenation is not a result of lack of racism, but a product of another type of racism where the rules of sexism permit sexual relations between white men and black women, and stigmatize the ones between white women and black men (ibid, p. 291).

Sexual violence in the colonial context cannot be reduced to concepts of consent, coercion or use of force. It was framed by war, economy, structural, social, racialized inequality. This allowed the possibility of sexual exploration and violation of black women to be seen as consensual, and black women as disponible and promiscuous (ibid, p. 295).

Nevertheless, when we talk about the colonized woman only as a subject of subordination, we are condemning her to a passive role. Women acted, fought, made efforts and developed strategies to survive under the colonial domination. They also had an important role in the resistance against colonial rule. They were part of guerillas, logistic aid, food and information collection. Sometimes to acquire that it had to be through intimacy with white men (ibid, pp. 295-297). Retonar: Traços de Memória collects 600 pictures, nevertheless, only 4 of them suggest sexual exploration (ibid, p. 300).

In 2017, the proposal for the instalment of the Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas won the Participatory Budgeting of Lisbon. The project was formulated by DJASS – Associação de Afrodescendentes, the non-profit organization was founded in 2016, which aims to bring attention to the consequences of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism that are still present in Portuguese society, in other words, the continuous inequality and discrimination of black people that still exists in Portugal.

The proposal for the Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas emerged from the lack of monuments that demonstrated the historical connection between Portugal and the transatlantic trade of enslaved people, as well as its legacy. In comparison to the existence of monuments that exalt and perpetuate a glorifying perspective of the history of Portugal and the colonial empire.

The monument aims to contribute to the public acknowledgement of Portugal's role, particularly Lisbon, had in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people, by:

- Celebrating African resistances against slavery.
- Highlight the African presence in Portugal and its contribution to Portuguese economy, culture and society.
- Make evident the historical continuities that connect the transatlantic trade of enslaved people legacy and the various forms of oppression and discrimination.
- Contribute to a polyphonic perspective of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

It was established that the memorial had to be designed by an African or an Afro-descendant artist. The project that won was designed by Kiluanji Kia Henda, “Plantação – Prosperidade e Pesadelo”, which was voted by an external jury.

The memorial aims to refer to a history that is not only about slavery but a past that precedes it, a legacy, and a set of personal, familial, and community losses to which these people belonged. The possibility of ensuring new encounters and new shared stories allows breaking chains while creating links of memory. This memorial aims to underline the economic nature of slavery while allowing contemplation to result from the space itself, thus making the location in which it is implanted relevant and shedding light on the place of slavery in the growth of Lisbon and the diaspora world due to its connection to the sea.

The memorial represents a plantation of 400 burnt sugarcane stalks as a symbol of the resistance of enslaved people. Distributed across the available triangular ground, the number of stalks represents the number of years of transcontinental slavery between Africa, Brazil, and Portugal. The benches form a large circle with a diameter of 13.50 meters, as if it were a "quilombo" of enslaved people. This space gives rise to a meeting point, simultaneously public and intimate, serving as a stage for various expressions, from music to small street performances, from civic dialogues to theatrical readings.

In 2023, Lisbon City Council was accused by DJASS of ‘sabotaging’ the memorial, following the proposal for the change of location for where the memorial would be built. The memorial was planned to be built in Campo das Cebolas, however, this year, the Lisbon City Council proposed to change the memorial to Doca da Marinha. DJASS considers that this change is a way for the municipality to prevent the construction of the memorial. Evalina Dias, president of DJASS, affirms that if the project is placed in Santa Apolónia it would be altered

and lose its original character, there would not be space for the 400 burnt sugarcane stalks and an interpretive centre that is also part of the project (SIC Notícias, 2023, 0:30-0:50).

In response, the Culture Councillor expressed regret over DJASS's statement, as it contains "false assertions" and represents "an insulting and political attack on Lisbon City Council, which has always shown itself to be completely open to dialogue, publicly stating that it wants to realize the memorial." From the city council's side, "the full dialogue continues, there is openness to reach a solution that addresses the technical issues and also satisfies the association," emphasized Diogo Moura, noting that the last meeting with DJASS took place in April, and the association has not proposed any alternative location so far (Lusa, 2023).

In the preliminary analysis, DGPC concluded that "there are several issues that need to be reviewed," including the project's drawings because they "have significant formal and visual impacts on the space and its surroundings." Furthermore, according to DGPC, "the intervention, if approved, would close off the square facing the Tagus River, exacerbating the barrier created by the parking lot wall and would have implications for the views of the Sé hill." (ibid).

DGPC's recommendation is that "alternative solutions should be found or a potential reduction or concentration of elements," the councillor added, mentioning that the consultation with EMEL indicates "leakage problems in the slab." The alternative proposed by the city council is the Doca da Marinha, "an area directly related to the trafficking of enslaved people," a pedestrian and grassy space by the river, located 200 meters ahead of Campo das Cebolas, which "offers more public space, even for some activities that the association is considering around the memorial." (ibid).

In 2018, the proposal for the instalment of the "Museu da Descoberta" in Lisbon stimulated a debate about the name of a museum about the Portuguese maritime expansion period, "Discoveries". RTP aired an episode by the series *Prós e Contras*, which promotes the debate about recent issues occurring in Portugal.

In this debate three participants are against the naming of the museum, Ângela Barreto Xavier, an Assistant Researcher at the Institute of Social Sciences at the University of Lisbon, a Ph.D. in History and Civilization from the European University Institute in Florence; António Camões Gouveia, a Ph.D in History and Theory of Ideas, specializing in History of Social Ideas by the Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities of the NOVA University of Lisbon.

Researcher at the Cultural History Center of the NOVA University of Lisbon and collaborator at the Religious History Study Center at the Catholic University of Portugal, he was also the Scientific Coordinator of the Robinson Foundation in Portalegre, director of the Évora Museum and collaborator of the National Commission for the Commemorations of Portuguese Discoveries; and Bruno Sena Martins, a Ph.D. in sociology and Researcher at the Centre for Social Studies at the University of Coimbra (CES/UC). He served as the Coordinator of the Ph.D. Program "Human Rights in Contemporary Societies" from 2013 to 2023 and as the Coordinator of the Extension Program "CES goes to school" from 2013 to 2020. He has participated in several international projects and conducted fieldwork in Portugal, Mozambique, and India.

While the other three participants are in favor of it, João Paulo Oliveira e Costa, a Ph.D in History, Director of CHAM – Centre of Humanities; Carlos Fiolhais, a Ph.D in Theoretical Physics from Goethe University in Germany and Professor of Physics at the University of Coimbra (UC), Fiolhais founded and directed the Computational Physics Centre and is the director of the Rómulo Centro Ciência Viva at UC; and Miguel Castelo Branco, then member of a Portuguese nationalist association, Nova Portugalidade, which aims to recover and reinterpret Portugal's past, basing Portugal's identity in its colonial past.

Xavier and Gouveia consider that the term "Discovery" does not cover Portugal's role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people (Prós e Contrás, 2018, 04:15-05:45; *ibid*, 12:02-12:42). Martins adds that opting for "Discovery" we are choosing a celebratory perspective about history, therefore, it does not offer different perspectives about the same period, emphasizing a Eurocentric narrative, where Portugal discovered Others. Whilst the other participants consider that the term "Discovery" relates to scientific innovations and 'multicultural' societies created in this period (*ibid*, 22:20-24:27).

Costa mentions the scripture in a building in Cidade Velha, Cabo Verde, that says "o apogeu desta cidade foi o comércio de escravos" ("the apogee of this city was the slave trade"). Costa also mentions the statue of Diogo Gomes and António Salazar with the flag of Cabo Verde. Furthermore, Costa also brings attention to a monument installed in Plateau with Portuguese symbols, although the words of Estado Novo have been removed. Costa then enumerates other statues of Portuguese colonialism's supporters, that exist in Ilha do Fogo (*ibid*, 32:00-34:10).

Hence, Costa argues that there had not been a removal of the statues, because Cabo Verde includes colonizers as part of its national history. Nevertheless, in 2021, the National Assembly of Cabo Verde received a petition for the removal of pro-slavery and colonialism monuments.

The participants also discussed Portugal's role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people. Xavier considers that we should not minimize the violence of the Portuguese Empire to slavery, since it was a generalized violence, and not just slavery (ibid, 40:28-41:18). Fiolhais counterpoints affirming that Portugal did not create slavery and that he does not agree with atonement of guilt, since he is not related to colonizers and slave owners (ibid, 41:50-43:03). Costa adds that slavery has existed since forever and that Portugal's is punishing itself for something no one punishes it for, furthermore, if we should feel ashamed about our past, then every country is going to feel embarrassed about their past, because every country has done bad things in the past (ibid, 44:35-46:22). Martins and Gouveia end the debate highlighting that museums should consider a plural perspective about the past (ibid, 43:03-44:30; ibid, 47:00-51:30).

"Fumaça" is a podcast of independent, progressive and dissident investigative journalism. It is owned by the non-profit association Verdes Memórias, controlled by the Fumaça editorial team. The podcast aims to create other media narratives and other structures of social communication and give a platform for those harmed by systems of oppression to express themselves.

The podcast's episode chosen as a secondary source debates the reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people. It is formulated as an unstructured interview where participants cover topics such as racism in Portugal; racism in Portuguese schoolbooks; and affirmative actions. Two types of reparation are addressed in this source: reformulation of schoolbooks discourse about the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and affirmative actions/quotas.

The episode includes the interventions of Inocência Mata, a professor at the Faculty of Humanities of the University of Lisbon, a Ph.D. in Humanities and a postdoctoral researcher in Postcolonial Studies; Luzia Moniz, a journalist, sociologist, and at that time president of PADEMA – Plataforma para o Desenvolvimento da Mulher Africana; and Solange Rocha, a historian, black feminist activist, professor at the Department of History of the Federal

University of Paraiba, postdoctoral researcher at the Centre for Social Studies of the University of Coimbra, and a member of BAMIDELÊ, an organization of black feminists in Paraiba.

The three participants, Moniz, Rocha and Mata, agree that Portugal contributed to the structural racism of various countries, namely Portugal and Brazil (Podcast Fumaça, 2019, 03:27-06:54). Mata adds that it is impossible to think about Portugal without the transatlantic trade of enslaved people (ibid, 30:35-35:56).

One of the ways that racism is perpetuated is through schoolbooks. Moniz considers that Portuguese education has the goal to whitewash Portuguese colonialism and to pass the idea of the “kind colonizer”, Moniz suggests that this practice reflects the political, public and academic discourses (ibid, 10:53-14:00). Mata addresses the discourse present in schoolbooks, where enslaved people are represented as a product, compared to spices and gold, rather than people who were enslaved (ibid, 14:00-18:27).

Mata affirms that the debate of reparations is not new in Portugal e.g., Sephardic Jews. Mata considers that positive discrimination and quotas are different. Representation is very important, e.g., professors should include in their bibliography more African authors; when we show to our students that there are African philosophers, sociologists, etc., students understand that in Africa African reflect about themselves (ibid, 25:40-30:27). Nevertheless, all participants agree that for quotas to be implemented a census with the data of race and ethnicity included must exist (ibid, 36:06-39:15).

In 2020, LIVRE’s electoral program included a proposal aiming that all the patrimony of the former colonies, present in Portuguese territory, to be returned to the countries of origin in order to “decolonize” state museums and monuments. LIVRE is a political Portuguese party founded in 2014. The party is considered to be positioned in the middle left and some of its principles are universalism, freedom, equality, solidarity, socialism, ecology and Europeanism. The proposal being analysed was part of LIVRE’s program for the State budget 2020 (OE2020) and it aims to “decolonize” state museums and monuments (LIVRE, 2020).

In order to do this, the preparation of the list of heritage to be restored would oversee a working group composed of museologists, curators, scientific researchers and anti-racism activists, with the purpose of promoting a critical view and recontextualization of the collections of museums and national monuments, particularly, in Museu Nacional da Arte

Antiga, Museu Nacional da Etnologia, Museu Nacional de Arqueologia, Torre de Belém e Mosteiro dos Jerónimos.

Furthermore, LIVRE proposed the creation of a group of museologists, curators and scientific researchers to generate a national listing of all the objects and patrimony brought from the former Portuguese colonies and that are currently property of Portuguese museums and archives, this measure would facilitate the identification of items that former Portuguese colonies would be willing to reclaim to their place of origin (LIVRE, 2020).

Discussion of findings

The sources provide data about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism in Portugal. The analysis of the sources is divided in five parts. First, it will explore the public discussions about the topic, in particular the episode from the series *Prós e Contras* episode selected from the podcast *Fumaça*. Second, it will focus on the articles from *Geometrias da Memória*, 2016. Third, it will explore Núcleo Museológico Rota da Escravatura in Lagos and Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas. Then, it will analyse the proposal by LIVRE. Finally, I will present my conclusions.

The television debate selected as a source demonstrates the two types of narrative present in the discussion about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism in Portugal.

On one side, it is considered that installing a museum about the history of Portugal in the period of transatlantic trade of enslaved people, naming it 'Museu da Descoberta' and not addressing slavery in this museum, we are celebrating only one perspective of history, which is Eurocentric. Thus, when installing a museum, it is relevant to include various perspectives about the same event.

On other side, 'discovery' relates to scientific innovations and 'multicultural' societies created in that period. The participants consider that we should not be ashamed of Portugal's past, because every country has done bad things in the past. The arguments on both sides are common in discussions about not only reparations in Portugal, but also in other countries. This source is relevant to understand the public discussions about the topic, as well as the main reasons for a country to avoid reparations. This source suggests the continuity of Luso

tropicalist narrative that is still present in Portugal, but also the opposite side, which defends a polyphonic perspective in museums.

The podcast episode serves as a counterpoint to the mainstream arguments about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism discussions in Portugal. It is highlighted that making reparations for crimes done in the past is not new to Portugal, hence it could be done in the future. Though we need to implement a census which includes race and ethnicity, so we can talk about structural racism, and therefore support the thesis that colonialism and the transatlantic trade of enslaved people still have an impact today. It also mentions the importance of schoolbooks in perpetuating an imperial and Luso tropicalist perspective about the past. Thus, schools should be more active in demystifying history. Hence, this source suggests that public discussions about the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism highlight making reparations through school curriculum reform.

The works selected from the book *Geometrias da Memória*, 2016, present a reflection about colonialism as well as its representation in museums. Furthermore, they reflect on how Portugal can improve in the representation of sexual violence against African women perpetrated under the Portuguese colonial empire, by bringing attention the sexualization of African women.

The source shows that Portuguese historiography is responsible for the continuity of the invisibility of colonial rape. Till this day, African people are still represented as subjects of Portuguese 'heroic' actions, they are seen as inhumane, animalized, 'products', without autonomy, rationality, identity and history. This is still the narrative transmitted to younger generations in schoolbooks.

One way that Portugal could make reparations could be in the representation of colonial rape from African women's perspective. The instalment of a museum, a section of a museum or a monument in honour of the victims of colonial sexual violence is necessary if Portugal is to make reparations for colonialism and the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

This is even more important for Portugal, since the narrative of Luso tropicalism permeates Portuguese schoolbooks, public speeches, debates, etc. The narrative that Portuguese

colonialism is different from other colonialisms, especially because of the relations that they had with African women, is still hegemonic in Portugal.

In other words, the source selected is a reflection on an exposition about the memory of African liberation wars. In this exposition only four photos are of women, who are being abused by Portuguese men. The sexualization of African women's bodies is still a memory of Portuguese colonialism. The issue of sexual violence during Portuguese colonialism should be represented in schoolbooks, media, museums and monuments if Portugal ever decides to make reparations.

The instalment of a museum centred in the period of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people located in Lagos, should be mentioned in the discussions about reparations in Portugal. First, because Lagos was an important site for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people. Second, it offers a representation and perspective about this period, which is often represented in Portugal in a lightweight way, exalting the colonizers and the Portuguese empire. Hence, this museum could serve as an example for other possible museums that could be installed in Portugal and that could signify accountability for the damage that the transatlantic trade of enslaved people brought to former colonized countries. In correlation with the literature reviewed about the topic, it was found that the placement of the museum is also an important aspect when making reparations. This source suggests that it could be possible for Portugal to implement reparations through instalment of museums informing Portugal's role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

The Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas represents a type of reparation done by Portugal. It will be built in Lisbon, a city where African people were enslaved, then sold as products. It is demonstrative of a history that is not only about slavery but a past that precedes it, a legacy, and a set of personal, familial, and community losses to which these people belonged. It underlines the economic nature of slavery while allowing contemplation to result from the space itself, thus making the location in which it is implanted relevant and shedding light on the place of slavery in the growth of Lisbon and the diaspora world due to its connection to the sea.

One important aspect about this memorial is that it was designed by an afro descendant; correlating to the literature reviewed, in the process of reparations it is important to give voice to the recipient of the reparation. This source suggests that Portugal could make reparations

through monuments and museums, whilst consulting with afro descendants, which is also an important aspect in the decision-making process of reparations.

Finally, it must be brought into attention the political attempt at making reparations formulated by a Portuguese political party, LIVRE. This program aimed to 'decolonize' state museums and monuments. This type of reparation has been applied in other countries. With this measure it would be possible for the former colonized countries to reclaim art pieces that were originally theirs. This source suggests that Portugal could possibly be making reparations by returning art pieces to former colonized countries.

From the research, it was possible to understand that the colonial memory is the support of Portuguese national identity. The idea that the Portuguese once discovered lands of people that were uneducated and 'primitive', and that Portugal colonial empire did many good things still prevails today.

From the data collected, it is not positive that Portugal will make financial reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism in a near future. However, it has shown to be more open to other measures that could possibly compensate for the past.

Based on the results, it could be suggested that a formal apology would be a starting point for the reparation process. The formal apology should be followed by the instalment of an interpretative centre or museum dedicated to the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism, which would consider testimonies of survivors, that could be managed by experts on postcolonial studies, for example.

The realization of events and conferences about the colonial memory from the African perspective could also be positive for the discussion of reparations. More importantly, it could be suggested a reformulation of history schoolbook chapters about the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism; furthermore, the Portuguese national curriculum should include fiction/non-fiction books from the Lusophone Community that may or may not address the experiences of the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism, since it may counterpoint the hegemonic stereotypes about African people.

It would also be relevant to counterpoint the colonial memory with a gender sensitive approach to history in monuments and museums, since the relations Portuguese men and

African women had in that period frame the Portuguese colonial memory; this could be done through a reformulation in schoolbook, instalment of monuments honouring survivors of colonial sexual abuse, etc. A postcolonial feminist approach to the topic could also be applied in the classrooms.

Conclusions

This dissertation examines and evaluates the discussion about the topic of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism. This study accessed the arguments present in public discussions about the topic and possible reparations that could be implemented in the future, as well as the proposals for reparations that have been presented by internal actors in Portugal and reparations that have already been implemented or are on the process of being implemented and its challenges.

First, it provides a review of the different types of reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism that have been discussed globally. Additionally, the study highlights the often-overlooked issue of reparations for sexual violence and its challenges. It considers that sexual violence is a relevant topic to address when making reparations in Portugal due to Portuguese historiography about the issue and the general discourse about the relationships between Portuguese soldiers and African women during colonialism, which is often considered as consensual, even though there were women that were sexually abused. In other words, it aims to shed light on the whitewashing of the sexual abuse against African women during the colonial period. Furthermore, it highlights the importance of including survivors in the decision-making process of reparations, to understand better what reparations could be more effective to make amendments for the harm inflicted on survivors.

The literature review about Portugal suggests that the terms ‘national amnesia’, ‘culture of silence’ and ‘unmemory’ are used when describing the relationship Portugal has with its past. Moreover, scholars also agree that the Portuguese government has made no effort to publicize and investigate the crimes committed during the colonial period and schoolbooks and educational curriculum gives continuity to the invisibility of Portuguese war crimes.

Literature about the topic of reparations in Portugal has some limitations. Literature on sexual violence against women under Portuguese colonial rule is still scarce; literature pertaining to the issue of sexual violence against women under the Portuguese colonial rule is more focused on the representation of this type of violence in fictional literature. Moreover, literature is more focused on Angola and Mozambique. Additionally, literature lacks data on male victims of sexual violence.

The literature about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism does not mention many of the forms of compensation for the violation of Human Rights, its focus is on official apologies, school curriculum and memorialization.

Due to the scarcity of initiatives from Portugal and former Portuguese colonies to make reparations the study relies on discussions about the topic in Portuguese podcasts, television shows episodes and scientific articles; LIVRE's proposal for the return of artifacts to African countries and monuments; the Museu de Escravatura, in Lagos, and the Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas, to be installed in Lisbon.

First, the episode from the series *Prós e Contras* that was selected as a source for analysis, discussed the proposal for the instalment of "Museu da Descoberta". This source is relevant to understand the mainstream arguments in debates about reparations in Portugal. One side defends a more nationalist view about this period, regarding reparations as pointless, since every nation has committed wrongs in the past, then every nation should have to make reparations; the other defends a polyphonic perspective in public spheres, leaving space for debating the past.

The episode from the podcast *Fumaça* serves as a counterpoint to the mainstream arguments about reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and Portuguese colonialism discussions in Portugal. It centres on the role of schools as an active player in the process of reparations and demystifying history.

The chapter selected from the book *Geometrias da Memória* presents a reflection on how Portugal could improve in the representation of sexual violence against African women perpetrated under the Portuguese colonial empire, by bringing attention to the sexualization of African women. This source suggests that the sexual abuse of African women should be considered when making reparations. One way that Portugal could make reparations could be in the representation of colonial rape from African women's perspective. The instalment of a museum, a section of a museum or a monument in honour of the victims of colonial sexual violence is necessary if Portugal is to make reparations for colonialism and the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

The instalment of *Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Esravos* aims to signify accountability for the damage that the transatlantic trade of enslaved people brought to former colonized countries. In correlation with the literature reviewed about the topic, it was found

that the placement of the museum is also an important aspect when making reparations. This source suggests that it could be possible for Portugal to implement reparations through instalment of museums informing Portugal's role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people.

The Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas represents a type of reparation in the process of being implemented in Portugal. One important aspect about this memorial is that it was designed by an afro descendant artist; correlating to the literature reviewed, in the process of reparations it is important to give voice to the recipient of the reparation. This source suggests that Portugal could make reparations through monuments and museums, whilst consulting with afro descendants, which is also an important aspect in the decision-making process of reparations.

Finally, it must be brought into attention the political attempt at making reparations formulated by the Portuguese political party LIVRE. This program aimed to 'decolonize' state museums and monuments. With this measure it would be possible for the former colonized countries to reclaim art pieces that were originally theirs. This source suggests that Portugal could possibly be making reparations by returning art pieces to former colonized countries.

Future research should adopt different data collection methods, more specifically, interviews with representatives of organized groups and communities of afro-descendants or others that fight against racial and ethnic discrimination in Portugal; political parties' members; scholars; etc., in order to have a better understanding of what survivors may consider as effective reparations.

From research it was possible to conclude that the discussion about the topic of reparations in Portugal is centred in policies of memorialization and tribute to enslaved and colonized people. It could be suggested that a formal apology could be a starting point in the reparation process, which could be followed by the instalment of an interpretative centre or museum dedicated to Portugal's role in the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism, as well as the damages caused by those.

Events, conferences, and a reformulation of history schoolbook chapters about the colonial memory from the African perspective could also aid in the process of reparations. Moreover, it is relevant to counterpoint the colonial memory with a gender sensitive approach to history in monuments and museums, since the relations Portuguese men and African women had in that period frame the Portuguese colonial memory.

The data collected suggests that the instalment of Núcleo Museológico do Mercado de Escravos, in Lagos, and of Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas, in Campo das Cebolas, represent attempts at making reparations for the transatlantic trade of enslaved people and colonialism.

To sum up, despite the hegemonic heroic narrative of Portuguese colonial memory, the results show that it is possible for Portugal to make reparations, more specifically, through museums, monuments, repatriation of artifacts and schoolbook reform.

Sources

- Almeida, M. (2002). Longing for oneself: hybridism and miscegenation. *Etnográfica*, VI (1), 181–200.
- Andrews, M. (2019). The narrative architecture of political forgiveness. *Political Psychology*, 40(3), 433–447. <https://doi.org/10.1111/pops.12533>
- Araujo, A. L. (2019). *Reparations for Slavery and the Slave Trade: A Transnational and Comparative History*. Bloomsbury Academic. <https://doi.org/10.1163/2405836x-00402006>
- Bentley, T. (2018). Colonial apologies and the problem of the transgressor speaking. *Third World Quarterly*, 39(3), 399–417. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2017.1401922>
- Brophy, A. (2006). *Reparations: Pro and Con*. Oxford University Press.
- Caiado, A. (2020). A presença de um imaginário imperial na monumentalização da memória da Guerra Colonial Portuguesa. *Centro de Estudos Sociais*, 20, 1–16.
- Cunneen, C. (2005). Colonialism and historical injustice: Reparations for indigenous peoples. *Social Semiotics*, 15(1), 59–80. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10350330500059130>
- da Silva, R., & Ferreira, A. S. (2019). The Post-Dictatorship Memory Politics in Portugal Which Erased Political Violence from the Collective Memory. *Integr Psych Behave*, 53, 24–43. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/s12124-018-9452-8>
- Debate Prós e Contrás (2018). Descobertas ou Descobrimientos (season 16, episode 24). RTP. <https://www.rtp.pt/play/p4234/e356981/pros-e-contras>
- Ferreira, M. T., Coelho, C., & Wasterlain, S. N. (2019). Discarded in the trash: Burials of African enslaved individuals in Valle da Gafaria, Lagos, Portugal (15th–17th centuries). *International Journal of Osteoarchaeology*, 29(4), 670–680. <https://doi.org/10.1002/oa.2747>
- Guardião, A., Jerónimo, M. B., Peixoto, P. (2022) *Ecos Coloniais: Histórias, Patrimónios e Memórias*. Autores e Editores tinta-da-china, Lda.

- Garraio, J. (2019). Framing Sexual Violence in Portuguese Colonialism: On Some Practices of Contemporary Cultural Representation and Remembrance. *Violence Against Women*, 25(13), 1558–1577.
- Hook, B. (2000). *Feminist Theory: From Margin to Center*. Pluto Press.
- Johnstone, G., Ness, D. (2007). *Handbook of Restorative Justice*. Taylor & Francis.
- Lusa. (2023, July 10). Lisboa promete concretizar Memorial de Homenagem às Pessoas Escravizadas. *Renascença*. <https://rr.sapo.pt/noticia/pais/2023/07/10/lisboa-promete-concretizar-memorial-de-homenagem-as-pessoas-escravizadas/338586/>
- LIVRE (27th January 2020). Proposta de Lei n.º 5/XIV/1 - Orçamento do Estado para 2020
CAPÍTULO IX. Artigo 203.º - A (novo). Programa para a Descolonização da Cultura.
- Loff, M. (2014). Dictatorship and revolution: Socio-political reconstructions of collective memory in post-authoritarian Portugal. *Culture & History Digital Journal*, 3(2), 1–12. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.3989/chdj.2014.017>
- Martins, C., Miranda, T. (2021). Da lixeira para o sótão: 155 esqueletos ímpares no mundo encaixotados em Coimbra. *Expresso*.
- Melber, H. (2020). Germany and Namibia: Negotiating Genocide. *Journal of Genocide Research*, 22:4, 502–514. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623528.2020.1750823>
- Pankhurst, D. (2003). The “Sex War” and Other Wars: Towards a Feminist Approach to Peace Building. *Development in Practice*, 13(2/3), 154–177. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0961452032000073152>
- Podcast Fumaça (2019). “Debate: ‘Abolida a escravatura, quem foi compensado? Os donos dos escravos’, Inocência Mata”. <https://fumaca.pt/debate-abolida-a-escravatura-quem-foi-compensado-os-donos-dos-escravos-inocencia-mata/>
- Ribeiro, A. S., Ribeiro, M. C. (2016). *Geometrias da Memória: Configurações Pós-Coloniais*. Edições Afrontamentos e Autores.

SIC Notícias. (2023, July 2). Memorial da escravatura em Lisboa está a gerar polémica. *SIC Notícias*. <https://sicnoticias.pt/cultura/2023-07-02-Memorial-da-escravatura-em-Lisboa-esta-a-gerar-polemica-284d290e>

United Nations. (2010). *Analytical & Conceptual Framing of Conflict-Related Sexual Violence*.

United Nations. (2014). *Guidance Note of the Secretary-General: Reparations for Conflict-Related Sexual Violence*.

Young, R. (2020). *Postcolonialism: A Very Short Introduction*. Very Short Introductions.

Bibliographical References

- Araujo, A. L. (2012). Politics of Memory: Making Slavery Visible in the Public Space. In Ana Lucia Araujo (Ed.), *Politics of Memory: Making Slavery Visible in the Public Space*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203119075>
- Ball, J. (2018). Staging of Memory: Monuments, Commemoration, and the Demarcation of Portuguese Space in Colonial Angola. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 44(1), 77–96. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057070.2018.1403265>
- Baptista, M. M. (2013). Portuguese Cultural Identity: from Colonialism to Post-Colonialism: Social Memories, Images and Representations of Identity. *Comunicação e Sociedade*, 24, 288–306. [https://doi.org/10.17231/comsoc.24\(2013\).1789](https://doi.org/10.17231/comsoc.24(2013).1789)
- Bastos, C. (2020). Intersections of Empire, Post-Empire, and Diaspora: De-Imperializing Lusophone Studies. *Journal of Lusophone Studies*, 5(2), 27–54. <https://doi.org/10.21471/JLS.V5I2.367>
- Boehme, F. (2020). Reactive remembrance: The political struggle over apologies and reparations between Germany and Namibia for the Herero genocide. *Journal of Human Rights*, 19(2), 238–255. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14754835.2020.1727729>
- Brooks, R. L. (1999). When Sorry Isn't Enough: The Controversy over Apologies and Reparations for Human Injustice. In R. L. Brooks (Ed.), *New York University Press*. New York University Press.
- Burnay, C. D., & Laffond, J. C. R. (2014). Television fiction and memory practices in Portugal and Spain (2000-2012): Some comparative reflections. *International Journal of Iberian Studies*, 27(2–3), 85–103. https://doi.org/10.1386/ijis.27.2-3.85_1
- Campos, Â. (2018). “We are still ashamed of our own History”: Interviewing ex-combatants of the portuguese colonial war (1961-1974). *Lusotopie*, 15(2), 107–126. <https://doi.org/10.1163/17683084-01502006>
- Correa, S. M. de S. (2011). History, memory, and commemorations: on genocide and colonial past in South West Africa. *Revista Brasileira de História*, 31(61), 85–103.

- Corredor, J., Wills-Obregon, M. E., & Asensio-Brouard, M. (2018). Historical memory education for peace and justice: definition of a field. *Journal of Peace Education*, 15(2), 169–190. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17400201.2018.1463208>
- Cunningham, M. (2008). “It Wasn’t Us and We Didn’t Benefit”: The Discourse of Opposition to an Apology by Britain for Its Role in the Slave Trade. *The Political Quarterly*, 79(2), 252–259.
- Hamrick, E., & Duschinski, H. (2018). Enduring injustice: Memory politics and Namibia’s genocide reparations movement. *Memory Studies*, 2(4), 437–454. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1750698017693668>
- Hein, P. (2020). The ambiguities of amending historical injustices and espousing a shared collective memory: the WWII forced labour narratives in Germany and Japan. *State Crime Journal*, 9(1), 47–70. <https://doi.org/10.13169/statecrime.9.1.0047>
- Henry, N. (2013). Memory of an Injustice: The “Comfort Women” and the Legacy of the Tokyo Trial. *Asian Studies Review*, 37(3), 362–380. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10357823.2013.771770>
- Kilomba, G. (2020). *Memórias da Plantação: Episódios de Racismo Quotidiano*. Orfeu Negro.
- Kim, J., Bisland, B. M. (Lee), & Shin, S. (2019). Teaching about the Comfort Women during World War II and the Use of Personal Stories of the Victims. *Education about Asia*, 24(3), 58–63. <https://www.asianstudies.org/publications/ea/archives/teaching-about-the-comfort-women-during-world-war-ii-and-the-use-of-personal-stories-of-the-victims/>
- Kim, J. (2020). Going transnational? A feminist view of “comfort women” memorials. *Asian Journal of Women’s Studies*, 26(3), 397–409. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12259276.2020.1808287>
- Lombardo, A. P., & Howard-Hassmann, R. E. (2005). Africans on Reparations: An Analysis of Elite and Activist Opinion. *Canadian Journal of African Studies / Revue Canadienne Des Études Africaines*, 39(3), 517–548. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00083968.2005.10751328>

- Lourenço, E. (2020). *O Labirinto da Saudade: Psicanálise Mítica do Destino Português*. Gradiva.
- Meneses, M. P. (2020). Fotografias indiscretas, memórias emudecidas: mulheres comuns em teatros de guerra em Moçambique. *Confluenze. Rivista Di Studi Iberoamericani*, 12(2), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.6092/issn.2036-0967/12123>
- Niezen, R. (2018). Speaking for the dead: the memorial politics of genocide in Namibia and Germany. *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 24(5), 547–567. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13527258.2017.1413681>
- Oostindie, G. (2009). Public memories of the Atlantic slave trade and slavery in contemporary Europe. *European Review*, 17(3–4), 611–626. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1062798709000970>
- Park, S. (2021). Colonialism and Sisterhood: Japanese Female Activists and the “Comfort Women” Issue. *Critical Sociology*, 47(1), 133–148. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0896920519876078>
- Park, J. H., Lee, K., Hand, M. D., Anderson, K. A., Hoon, J., Lee, K., Hand, M. D., & Anderson, K. A. (2016). Korean Survivors of the Japanese “Comfort Women” System: Understanding the Lifelong Consequences of Early Life. *Journal of Gerontological Social Work*, 59(4), 332–348. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01634372.2016.1204642>
- Raphael-Hernandez, H., & Wiegink, P. (2017). German entanglements in transatlantic slavery: An introduction. *Atlantic Studies: Global Currents*, 14(4), 419–435. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14788810.2017.1366009>
- Rodrigues, I. N. (2018). Descolonizar a fantasmagoria. Uma reflexão a partir do “Massacre de 1953” em São Tomé e Príncipe. *Revista Crítica de Ciências Sociais*, 115, 29–50. <https://doi.org/10.4000/rccs.6954>
- Rodrigues, I. N. (2019). *Espectros de Batepá: memórias e narrativas do “Massacre de 1953” em São Tomé e Príncipe*. H-Luso-Africa. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11273-020-09706-3>
<https://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jweia.2017.09.008>
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy>

