

Hervé Pennec

An Ethiopian *Mille-feuille*: Unearthing the history of the Jesuit mission to Ethiopia (21st - 16th centuries)



Centro de Estudos Internacionais





An Ethiopian *Mille-feuille*: Unearthing the history of the Jesuit mission to Ethiopia (21<sup>st</sup> - 16<sup>th</sup> centuries)



Portrait of Francisco Maria Esteves Pereira *Encyclopedia Aethiopica,* 2, p. 389. Title

An Ethiopian *Mille-feuille*: Unearthing the history of the Jesuit mission to Ethiopia (21st - 16th centuries)

Financed by Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia through the Programatic Financing for CEI-Iscte UIDP/03122/2020

**Author** Hervé Pennec

**Translation** Sarah Joksimovic Manuel João Ramos

**Revision** Manuel João Ramos Paddy Greenleaf

**Cover** Photo by Hervé Pennec

**ISBN** 978-989-781-718-2

Copyright © 2022 Centro de Estudos Internacionais do Instituto Universitário de Lisboa

CEI-Iscte, Sala 2W06 Av.ª das Forças Armadas 1649-026 Lisboa PORTUGAL +351 210 464 029 http://cei.iscte-iul.pt cei@iscte-iul.pt

Table	e of	Con	tents
Iavie	: 01	COIL	lents

Acknowledgements	i
Preface	ii
Summary	1
Introduction	7
Chapter 1	30
Francisco Maria Esteves Pereira (1854-1924): the "lonely" Ethiopianist	
1. Esteves Pereira: Colonel of Military Engineering and Editor of Ethiopian Texts	31
1.1 The archival fonds: a personal file at the Arquivo Histórico Militar	31
1.2 Beyond the military career: personal life and academic life	32
2. His beginnings as a Ge'ez specialist.	37
2.1 A "trial run" as a Ge'ez translator with the Magseph Assetat	37
2.2 The <i>Magseph Assetat</i> : genesis and chronology of a theological treatise	38
2.3 The História de Minas: a second collaboration with Basset	43
3. The early days of his orientalist career: Portugal and the Jesuits in the $16^{\text{th}}$ and $17^{\text{th}}$ centuries (1886-1900)	47
3.1 The História de Minas	47
3.2 Chronica de Susenyos, rei de Etiópia (1607-1632)	49
3.3 The appearance of more precise references in the writings of Esteves Pereira	51

# Chapter 2

# Camillo Beccari (1849-1928): the canoniser

1. Camillo Beccari: postulator general for the cause of the saints and editor of missionary documents on Ethiopia		
1.1 Camillo Beccari's intellectual journey (1849-1928)		
1.2 A prolific author of varied interests		
I. Publication of documents for the processes of beatification and canonization	58	
II. Historical articles	58	
III. Exemplary life of the author's mother	59	
IV. European document editions on Ethiopia (16 <sup>th</sup> -19 <sup>th</sup> centuries)	59	
2. The Rerum Aethiopicarum knowledge on a topical subject	63	
2.1 <i>RÆSOI</i> and the European colonial context	63	
2.2 RÆSOI, the essential reference	68	
2.3 Volume 1 of $R \not\in SOI$ : the intentions and issues of the collection	71	
Chapter 3	79	
Pedro Páez and the História da Etiópia. For each production and		
publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges		
	80	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of</li> </ul>	80 83	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue</li> </ul>		
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue</li> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> </ul>	83	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue</li> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> <li>1.2 The <i>História da Etiópia</i>: knowledge to refute</li> <li>1.3 European reactions: Jesuit defences against the Dominicans at</li> </ul>	83 87	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue <ol> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> <li>1.2 The <i>História da Etiópia</i>: knowledge to refute <ol> <li>3 European reactions: Jesuit defences against the Dominicans at the beginning of the 17<sup>th</sup> century</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. The edition of <i>História da Etiópia</i> by Beccari at the beginning of the</li> </ol></li></ul>	83 87 89	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue <ol> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> <li>1.2 The <i>História da Etiópia</i>: knowledge to refute <ol> <li>3 European reactions: Jesuit defences against the Dominicans at the beginning of the 17<sup>th</sup> century</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. The edition of <i>História da Etiópia</i> by Beccari at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century: the discovery of a writer and an explorer</li> </ol></li></ul>	83 87 89 95	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue <ol> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> <li>1.2 The <i>História da Etiópia</i>: knowledge to refute <ol> <li>3 European reactions: Jesuit defences against the Dominicans at the beginning of the 17<sup>th</sup> century</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. The edition of <i>História da Etiópia</i> by Beccari at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century: the discovery of a writer and an explorer <ol> <li>Pedro Páez: the discovery of a missionary writer</li> <li>2.2 Rehabilitation of an explorer and pleading in favour of the</li> </ol> </li> </ol></li></ul>	83 87 89 95 97	
<ul> <li>publishing context, a defining issue and new challenges</li> <li>1. A writing mission and <i>História da Etiópia</i> (17<sup>th</sup> century). The case of geographical knowledge in dialogue <ol> <li>1.1 Luis de Azevedo: from geopolitical knowledge to propaganda.</li> <li>1.2 The <i>História da Etiópia</i>: knowledge to refute <ol> <li>3 European reactions: Jesuit defences against the Dominicans at the beginning of the 17<sup>th</sup> century</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. The edition of <i>História da Etiópia</i> by Beccari at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century: the discovery of a writer and an explorer <ol> <li>Pedro Páez: the discovery of a missionary writer</li> <li>Rehabilitation of an explorer and pleading in favour of the Society of Jesus</li> </ol> </li> </ol></li></ul>	83 87 89 95 97 98	

3.3 Corrections after the author's death (1622)107

3.4 A História da Etiópia unsuitable for publication	
3.5 A difference of opinion: António Fernandes versus Pedro Páez	114
3.6 Pedro Páez, the Castilian Jesuit: nationalistic	117
instrumentalisation	

# Chapter 4

122

Sources, archaeology, contexts. Issues around *cal/chunambô*, *norra / nurâ* (lime mortar)

1. Historiographical debates from the 1980s to 2017	
1.1 Debate on <i>chunambô</i> and <i>norra / nurâ</i> of the 1980s: internalist versus externalist history	125
1.2 Discussions resumed in the late 1990s	127
1.3 Recent investigations and further historiographical discussion	
1.4 Archaeology as a servant of Jesuit missions	
2. For a "kaleidoscopic" history and possibilities	
2.1 The circumstances of the writing of the <i>História da Etiópia a alta</i> by Almeida: the forced writing of a trauma	147
2.2 Pedro Páez, church builder in Ethiopia?	151
2.3 Obituaries of Páez's companions by Almeida	156
2.4 Oral histories: the <i>nura/norra</i> at "the heart of conflicts"	165
Epilogue	168

### Sources and documentation

171

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The present translation and publication would not have been possible without the financial assistance granted by the Institute of African Worlds (IMAF) and the Centre for African Studies of ISCTE, to who I am most grateful. The scrupulous follow-up and the conscientious reworking of the translation by Manuel Joao Ramos, and the proofreading by Paddy Greenleaf make the manuscript accessible in English and give visibility to this research, which would otherwise have remained on the shelves of the French-speaking world.

I hereby wish to thank all those who have offered their generous critical advice: Angelo Torre, Pierre-Antoine Fabre, Marie-Laure Derat, Antonella Romano, Henri Médard, Eric Jolly, Marianne Lemaire, Anaïs Wion, Ines G. Županov, Sisay Sahilé, and especially my accomplice in the field, Manuel João Ramos. I also wish to thank all those who have sharpened my critical senses and my desire to render the social world in which we live understandable: Andreu Martínez d'Alòs- Moner, Fernandez, V.M, Leonardo Cohen Shabot, Javier Reverte, W. Soto Artuñedo SJ.

I dedicate this book to Marie-Louise Gicquel.

### PREFACE

A preliminary word is in order about the publication of this book in the E-Book'IS collection. When we received Hervé Pennec's proposal to publish his text, we welcomed it enthusiastically since it was not only an excellent opportunity to expand the scope of disciplines in the collection by embracing a critical and innovative problematisation of East African historiography, but also because it is the product of a personal research journey that was carried out over many years as part of a longstanding collaboration between IMAF<sup>1</sup> (previously CEMAF) members and a team from CEI-Iscte. This enduring cooperation has led to regular joint fieldwork in Ethiopia, the co-organisation of a stream of research seminars, workshops, exhibitions, and conferences, and to the publication of various academic books and scientific articles.

This is the first book in the E-Book'IS collection explicitly aimed at discussing the historiographical conundrums which are rich in studies of the Horn of Africa. Previous books have dealt critically with historical material about the region, but the decision to publish *The Ethiopian Millefeuilles* clearly marks an intention to open our collection to historical research (and researchers) as an integral part of international

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Institut des Mondes Africains, a CNRS research unit.

studies. As is clearly demonstrated in the final chapters of the book, contemporary research in regional studies is heir to and frequently an unwilling prisoner of earlier endeavours, and thus the inquiry into the conditionality of knowledge produced on a particular topic or region is an indispensable requirement for any sound scientific analysis.

This book is the outcome of prolonged time travel. It was in the mid-nineties that the author began working on the dense volumes of documentation produced by the members of the Jesuit mission in Ethiopia, from 1550 to 1630. This work has enabled him to dissect both European and Ethiopian materials and complement archival research with regular fieldwork inquiries in the areas where that mission established itself for almost a century. Years of immersion in these materials and collaboration with both students of the history of religious missions and researchers specialising in the region of Ethiopia, be they anthropologists, historians or archaeologists, paved the way for another type of quest: the questioning of the conditions and ways in which knowledge was produced by the missionaries themselves and by the historiographers and hagiographers who set about publishing that body of knowledge from the 19<sup>th</sup> to the 21<sup>st</sup> centuries.

A *millefeuilles* indeed. Hervé Pennec offers us the chance to taste the savoury labyrinth of texts, images, and references that, layer upon layer, century upon century, the West has produced, largely for its own consumption, on the Northern Ethiopian plateau. We, the editors of E-Book'IS are sure the reader will enjoy this gourmet experience to the full.

Manuel João Ramos